

”Qualms” from Lavenda, cond-mat/0311270

D.H.E. Gross*

*Hahn-Meitner-Institut Berlin, Bereich Theoretische Physik, Glienickerstr.100
14109 Berlin, and Freie Universität Berlin, Fachbereich Physik, Germany, and Università di
Firenze and INFN, Sezione di Firenze, via Sansone 1, 50019 Sesto F.no (Firenze), Italy. 2
February 2008*

Abstract: The smoke (German: Qualm) produced by Lavenda obscures the simple and fundamental physics of non-extensive systems as proposed in [1].

The paper [1] addresses phase-transitions in systems with a fixed, finite, volume, here the Potts- $(q = 3)$ -lattice gas on a 50×50 lattice, details in the cited papers [2,3]. Therefore, the volume is irrelevant for the transition. We have a system with the *two* control-parameters E, N . For this case Lavenda makes several wrong statements:

- (1) **”The author discards the fundamental properties of concavity”**. Yes, this is the essence of my new extended formulation of thermostatics: At phase-separation the entropy $[S(E)$ not $S(E)/N(!)]$ of any system is convex (bimodal). Therefore, in conventional thermostatics one gets in the thermodynamic limit Yang-Lee singularities. These are certainly not helpful to give a detailed insight into this most interesting physics: The original objects of Thermodynamics, steam engines, work exactly at phase-separation. Sailing on the surface of the sea would, presumably be impossible if there were no phase-separation. In hot nuclei this is the region where all the interesting fragmentation phenomena occur, from nucleon evaporation, to fission, to multifragmentation, and finally to vaporization.
- (2) **”The curvature eigenvalues $\lambda_1 \geq \lambda_2$ are devoid of any physical meaning.”** On the contrary: for a totally concave entropy surface $S(E, N)$ the condition $\lambda_1 < 0$ guarantees that Lavenda’s equation (4)

for any u, v at fixed volume V is fulfilled:

$$S_{EE} \times u^2 + 2S_{EN} \times uv + S_{NN} \times v^2 \leq 0 \quad (1)$$

This can also be seen by starting from Lavenda's equation for the eigen-curvatures :

$$\lambda_{1,2} = \frac{1}{2}(S_{NN} + S_{EE}) \pm \frac{1}{2}\sqrt{(S_{NN} - S_{EE})^2 + 4S_{EN}^2} \quad (2)$$

If both eigenvalues are < 0 then evidently both S_{NN} and S_{EE} must be negative. Therefore, the single condition $\lambda_1 < 0$ suffices to guarantee relation (1), and of course also Lavenda's conditions (2+3).

- (3) **"The inverse temperature β has no meaning in the micro-canonical ensemble"**. Yes, of course, however, what was discussed in my paper [1] is the weight of a given energy in the Laplace transform $E \rightarrow T$:

$$Z(T, \mu, V) = \int_0^\infty dE e^{S(E) - \beta E}, \quad (3)$$

with the external parameter $\beta = 1/T$. The weight $e^{S(E) - \beta E}$ has a single maximum in mono-phases, and at phase-separation it is bimodal, where it has at least two sharp maxima separated by the latent heat with a minimum in between (convexity).

- (4) **"Extensivity of the entropy is already incorporated in Boltzmann–Planck's principle $S = k \ln W$ "**. First, extensivity and additivity are two different things. For two independent and non-interacting systems the microcanonical Boltzmann-Planck entropy is of course additive, $S = S_1 + S_2$. Extensivity means something else: $S(N)$ scales as $S(N) \propto N$. This is usually demanded in the thermodynamic limit but is, of course, invalid in non-extensive situations.

References

- [1] D.H.E. Gross. *Non-extensive Hamiltonian systems follow Boltzmann's principle not Tsallis statistics. – Phase Transitions, Second Law of Thermodynamics, Physica A*, 305:99–105, (2002), cond-mat/0106496.
- [2] D.H.E. Gross. *Microcanonical Thermodynamics: Phase transitions in "Small" systems, Lecture Notes in Physics, 66*, World Scientific, Singapore, 2001.
- [3] D.H.E. Gross and E. Votyakov. *Phase Transitions in Small systems, Eur.Phys.J.B*, 15:115–126, (2000), cond-mat/?9911257.